CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 28, 2013 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by 2nd Vice-Chair Marrone at 1:03 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Absent
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Absent
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Poordmomhor	Maria Curry	Procent arr

Boardmember Maria Curry Present arrived @ 1:12 PM
Boardmember Tom Larimer Present arrived @ 1:08 PM

BoardmemberEvelya RiveraPresentBoardmemberAbel SilvasPresentBoardmemberAnn WoodsPresent

Staff to the Board in Attendance Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary

Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Jodie Brown, Senior Planner Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern Sarah Vonesh, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR January 24, 2013

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 24, 2013 MINUTES WITH CHANGES

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas Vote: 7-0-1 Motion Passes

(Marrone)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Dan Soderberg – Craftsman era bungalows in Normal Heights; would like to see these given due consideration for historic designation during "Over 45" review.

Ione Stiegler – Uptown survey identified modest bungalows built by Pacific Building Company as a kit movement. It should be seen as an overarching designation or cluster.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES

Chair Lemmo and Vice-Chair Garbini notified staff they would not be in attendance.

OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- It is that time of year again to nominate your favorite historic preservation project, program or person for an award. Nominations are being accepted until Tuesday, April 2, 2013. The nomination form can be completed electronically and submitted via the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic
- Those owners whose property was designated in 2012 or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement at this time. Those applications are due no later than April 2, 2013 to be considered this year and also can be found on the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, March 6, 2013. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, March 11, 2013. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 13, 2013.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 1 referral from Development Services and 3 individual homeowner nominations. There are 3 homeowner nominations in 2012 and 5 in 2013 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – THOMAS AND MARGARET TURNEY HOUSE

ITEM 7 - GEORGE AND MARY WILLIAMS HOUSE

ITEM 8 – THOMAS AND KATHERINE CARTER/LINCOLN ROGERS HOUSE

Boardmember Larimer pulled Item 6

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7 AND 8 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

Boardmember Silvas commented that he would like to see more designations in other communities and more Criterion A designations.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 372 FOURTH AVENUE

Applicant: Bosa Development Company represented by Marie Burke Lia

Owned by: Williams Family Trust / Elizabeth W. Awes Separate Property Trust

Location: 372 Fourth Avenue, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1289 4-A)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 372 Fourth Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 372 Fourth Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 13-007

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Elizabeth Awes

In Opposition: Dan Soderberg, John Eisenhart (Eva Thorn), Bruce Coons

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge had questions on the roof form. She is amazed that we are looking at a 1924 type of construction that is so current today that it is being recommended for the air and the light. The outside form is there. The missing roll up doors and loading dock are critical to a warehouse, but not necessarily this warehouse. She thinks modifications would probably be approved today as consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Boardmember Rivera doesn't agree with Staff's recommendation and would like to see this designated. We don't apply the same level of integrity to commercial building as we do to single family residences. The form and materials are still there.

Boardmember Larimer is on the fence. Items that jumped out were the design of the building; it is clearly a warehouse by typology. It is significant in the changing of that neighborhood because it is the lone building that is remaining and intact. With adaptive reuse in a warehouse, you would expect roll up doors to be replaced with windows. Interior has not been altered from warehouse. He does not think there is enough information to connect the building to Spreckels.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of February 28, 2013 Page 4 of 6

Boardmember Bethke doesn't think that the historical significance has been addressed. The warehouse and monitor form is there, but it is not historically significant. Criterion C cannot be met, even if it is the last one in San Diego. He would look at Criterion A, but isn't sure there is enough information in report to designate.

2nd Vice-Chair Marrone supports designation; it still retains its form and roofline. It is a good example of adaptive reuse.

Boardmember Silvas likes the term "community memory" and likes Criterion A.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with most of what Boardmember Bethke said, but does feel that the integrity has been significantly compromised. He is in favor of Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods also agreed with Boardmember Bethke. She would like to ask for more information, especially on Criterion A. It is likely that this building exemplifies part of that neighborhood's social and economic development and may be the last building that does that.

Boardmember Curry thinks is should be designated. It is a Utilitarian building, not stylistically ornate. It served a purpose and the profile and shape is still there. Need to look more at Criterion A. The fact that we adopted the survey is important. It has integrity and is historic. Changes are reversible.

Boardmember Berge thinks there needs to be a comparative analysis. She is looking at building type and it does embody distinctive characteristics of the type. She supports designation under Criterion C.

Boardmember Curry believes other warehouses have been designated in the past.

Boardmember Silvas thinks it is the community memory of this form.

Boardmember Larimer doesn't want the decision to be based on the fear of losing this resource but based on the merits of whether or not it is historically significant. The question still remains, is this building historically significant above and beyond its integrity. He doesn't think that the question has been answered.

Boardmember Bethke thinks it would be helpful to review the Warehouse District context.

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 60 DAYS AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST

ITEM 6 – THOMAS AND MAGARET TURNEY HOUSE

Applicant: Ramin Pourteymour Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 9805 Blackgold Road, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 1-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 9805 Blackgold Road as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Thomas and Margaret Turney House located at 9805 Blackgold Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1971-1978 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 13-008

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May

In Opposition: None

Historical Resources Board Minutes of February 28, 2013 Page 5 of 6

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods agrees with Staff's recommendation, it is a very unique building.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas asked if it was premature to designate, as the building is only 34 years old.

2nd Vice-Chair Marrone supports Staff's recommendation; the changes that were done to it still support the style and its form.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation; the roof coloring was a bit of concern.

Boardmember Larimer agrees that the form is still there, but the aesthetic is so far altered and removed from what it originally was. He has a hard time designating it with a period of significance of 1971-78 as it is currently built.

Boardmember Rivera stated that the report mentions a lot of changes including the roof. She thinks that the vegetation might be significant.

Boardmember Berge doesn't support designation today. Building used to blend into the landscape; color makes a big difference. It is relatively new and does not embody the distinctive characteristics that are necessary.

Boardmember Larimer doesn't believe the building retains integrity as is. The roof makes up more than 50% of the building.

2nd Vice-Chair Marrone viewed it the same as Tudor Revival homes which have prominent roof, often have the wood shingle roof replaced with composite.

Boardmember Bethke thinks the roof modification is a significant modification that impacts the design.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY 2nd VICE CHAIR MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – THOMAS AND MARGARET TURNEY HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

After the motion was made by 2nd Vice Chair Marrone and seconded by Boardmember Curry; Vonn Marie May, representing the owner, asked for a 30-day continuance per the Municipal Code Section 123.0202d. The Board granted the continuance.

ITEM 7 – GEORGE AND MARY WILLIAMS HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Nicholas M. Gistaro Living Trust and Tina M. Zenzola represented by IS Architecture <u>Location</u>: 4117 Lymer Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 3-H**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4117 Lymer Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the George and Mary Williams House located at 4117 Lymer Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1971 southeast wing addition and the 2008 addition totaling approximately 510 square feet.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of February 28, 2013 Page 6 of 6

Report Number: HRB 13-010

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – THOMAS AND KATHERINE CARTER/LINCOLN ROGERS HOUSE

Applicant: Lakosil Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4290 Randolph Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1268 4-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4290 Randolph Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Thomas and Katherine Carter/Lincoln Rogers House located at 4290 Randolph Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation shall include the mature Cedar tree in the front yard of the property. The designation shall exclude the 424 square foot, two story tower and side addition constructed in 1988 and the 494 square foot 1st-floor family room addition with a deck above constructed in 1992.

Report Number: HRB 13-011

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, March 28, 2013

LOCATION: City Administration Building

12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:35 PM